

*Conference Proceeding No. 3*

**PROCEEDINGS  
OF THE LAUNCHING CEREMONY OF  
SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT IN PAKISTAN  
ANNUAL REVIEW, 1998**

**1998**

**Social Policy and Development Centre**

**PROCEEDINGS  
OF THE LAUNCHING CEREMONY OF  
SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT IN PAKISTAN  
ANNUAL REVIEW, 1998**

**April 27, 1998**

# CONTENTS

Page#

---

Foreword

Welcome Address by Dr. Aisha Ghaus-Pasha, Acting Managing Director  
Social Policy and Development Centre I

Address by H. E Marie-Andree Beauchemin, Canadian High Commissioner VI

Address by Mr. Moin Qureshi, Chairman, Social Policy and Development Centre IX

Address by H.E Lt. Gen, Moin Uddin Haider (Retd), Governor of Sindh XVI

Programme XXI

List of Participants XII

Newspapers Clipings

## FOREWORD

This report is based on the proceedings of the launching ceremony of Social Development in Pakistan-Annual Review 1998 held at Karachi. The genesis of the Review was the realisation that even through social enhancement plays a crucial role in improving the quality of life of the masses, its various facets need to be explored with much more understanding and critical issues need to be brought on the forefront. Social Development in Pakistan fills this existing gap in literature on Pakistan and distinguishes itself as being the only analytical, well-researched, national publication on social sectors.

The inaugural Annual Review provides an empirical analysis of the relationship between economic growth and social development. It traces the evolution of the social sectors in Pakistan over the last 50 years, highlights differences between provinces and districts and compares Pakistans' social development with other countries. It provides insight into government policies and programs including the Social Action Program and outlines a strategy for social sector development.

The Review will be an annual publication of Social Policy and Development Centre (SPDC), an independent private sector research organisation. SPDC is involved in creating awareness of social development issues, a crucial pre-requisite to social sector progress in the country.

This report compiles the addresses of the Chief Executive Officer, SPDC, the Canadian High Commissioner, Chairman, SPDC and Governor of Sindh, the Chief Guest of the Ceremony. Dr. Aisha Ghaus-Pasha, the Chief Executive Officer of SPDC in her welcome address highlights the importance and contribution of SPDC and briefly introduced Social Development in Pakistan. H.E. Madam Andree Beauchmen the Canadian High Commissioner while remarking on the Review said that it is a landmark report which offers a new vision for social development in Pakistan. She stated that this was one of the fruits of the very rich development partnership that exists between Canada and Pakistan. The Chairman of SPDC, Moeen Qureshi, inaugurating the Review noted that the Report's analysis and presentation compares with the best reports, including those from such prestigious multilateral institutions as the World Bank and the Asian Development Bank. H.E. Lt. General Moinuddin Haider (Retd.), Governor of Sindh stated that the Review as a very useful document for all the general readers, the users, the implementors and the policy makers.

The launching ceremony was graced by a number of distinguished guests. These included many eminent economic scholars, policy makers, researchers, representatives of the NGO community and corporate sector personalities.

**WELCOME ADDRESS BY  
DR. ASHIA GHAUS-PASHA  
ACTING MANAGING DIRECTOR  
SOCIAL POLICY AND DEVELOPMENT CENTRE**

**WELCOME ADDRESS BY DR. AISHA GHAUS-PASHA  
ACTING MANAGING DIRECTOR,  
SOCIAL POLICY AND DEVELOPMENT CENTRE**

Your Excellencies, Lt. Gen. Moinuddin Haider and Madame Beauchemin,

It is my pleasure to welcome you and all of the guests who are present today at this launching ceremony for the Inaugural Annual Review of Social Development in Pakistan.

Very nearly three years ago today, the Social Policy and Development Centre was launched as a private sector independent research institute. It was an outcome of the realisation both by the donors and the governments that there was a need for a focal point for undertaking public policy analysis and research in the development of the social sectors, which have not kept pace with economic growth in the country.

Some of you, Ladies and Gentlemen, are perhaps being exposed to SPDC for the first time. Let me very briefly introduce you to it.

SPDC is controlled by a Board of Directors of eminent personalities each committed to the development of the social sectors. Our Chairman, Mr. Moeen Qureshi, needs no introduction to anyone here. Our Vice-Chairman, Senator Sartaj Aziz, is the creator of the Social Action Programme. Dr. Hafiz A. Pasha has been at the forefront of social sector policy research and analysis for the last many years. Mr. Javed Jabbar is Chairman Bahn Bheli, an NGO in Sindh. Mr. Saeed Qureshi and Mr. Rafiq Akhund bring their experience in public administration to the Board. Last but not the least Dr. QuratuI Ain Bakhtiari - She is a renowned community development expert and has worked a miracle for female education in the country.

SPDC represents the culmination of four years of research in the social sectors funded by the Canadian Government as a support to Pakistan's Social Action Programme. We are also

honoured in having the Canadian High Commissioner gracing this occasion. Her presence alone is symptomatic of the importance her government places in the role that SPDC has played in

impacting on public policy in Pakistan, particularly in the areas of planning, fiscal policy and social sector policy and development.

SPDC's purpose is to develop the capacity of public and private sector institutions and nongovernmental organisations to plan, design, finance, execute and manage social sector development programmes, in a cost-effective manner. Its objectives are manifold. Principally they are to increase knowledge and awareness of governance and social sector issues; to assist government in increasing and improving the provision of social services; to identify mechanisms for increased financing of services through improved resource mobilisation and improved efficiency and cost effectiveness of expenditures and help in the process of increasing the involvement of the private sector, NGOs and community-based organisations in overall of social-sector development in Pakistan.

Ladies and Gentlemen, in the very short span of time that SPDC has been in existence, we have been able to carve out a number of niches for ourselves. The first is by pioneering the development of an integrated social sector planning model. A modified version of this Model is being used by the Planning Commission for preparing the Ninth Five Year Plan. The second is in undertaking policy analysis in the Economics and Development of the Social Sectors. The third niche is as an independent, objective and apolitical organisation when evaluating public and private sector initiatives in social sector development.

SPDC has compiled a 25-year consistent time series of statistics on social sectors. It has been at the forefront of research into decentralisation and has been an advocate for effective local governments. Its role has been recognised internationally by its inclusion as a partner organisation for the Global Decentralised Governance Programme by the UNDP in New York.

Nationally also, recognition of SPDC's capability and capacity as a premier policy analysis institute

and our acceptance by government is demonstrated by the nomination of our key staff members to about 30 Commissions, Committees, Task Forces, Panels and Expert Working Groups established by the federal and provincial Governments in the last three years.

Our success lies in adopting a multidisciplinary approach to all our key activities. SPDC has

developed a network of associates available both within the country and internationally through its counterpart Canadian Advisory Agency. This is a consortium of three Canadian firms selected by CIDA to increase SPDC's capacity and capability. The consortium is led by Cowater International Inc. with experience of promoting community based delivery of social services in over 10 countries in South America, Central Africa and South and South-East Asia. The other members are the Institute on Governance and the University of Western Ontario.

SPDC places great emphasis on disseminating its research finding not only to senior bureaucrats and politicians involved in forming public policy but also to public at large. Social Development in Pakistan which being launched today constitutes a landmark in our dissemination efforts. It address issues which are central to future development of social sectors and thereby the well-being of our society. Chapter 1 of the report provides an empirical analysis of the relationship between economic growth and social development and establishes the central role of human development in the growth process. It offers some compelling arguments as to the importance of investing in social development as a way of ensuring economic growth and prosperity for Pakistan in the long-run. Presenting a cross-country analyses, it establishes the importance of education, particularly vocational and technical and female education for the economic development of nations. Empirically examining the case of diverting public funds from investment in economic to a social infrastructure, it demonstrate that such a reallocation can, in the medium-run, accelerate economic growth in the country. We reiterate that no nation in recent years has been able to achieve the status of a middle-income country, let alone a developed and prosperous one, without investing in human capital.

Chapter 2 traces the evolution of the social sectors in Pakistan over the last 50 years and

compares Pakistan's social development with other countries in the region. It concludes that, while Pakistan has demonstrated strong economic performance since independence, this has not been matched by a corresponding improvement in social development. This chapter also highlights differences between the provinces by comparing the levels of development through a number of indices like the Human Development Index, and the Gender Development Index. This focus on provincial development profiles and development strategies distinguishes Social Development in Pakistan from the galaxy of reports - nationally and internationally.



Chapter 3 provides a broad overview of government programs and policies in the social sectors. The Chapter also addresses some of the funding and service delivery issues. The report shows that given the heavy reliance of provincial governments on federal transfers and the fact that the new National Finance Commission Award, reduces transfers to provinces by about 18%, the financial Sustainability of social sectors becomes an increasingly important issue. It concludes that, unless there is a fundamental change in the way social services are supported and delivered, Pakistan will continue to lag behind its neighbours in social development.

The Review shows that Social Action Programme, has increased public expenditures on social sector development. However, this has not been matched by a commensurate improvement in social indicators. In an effort to identify the reasons for the lack of success of SAP, the Review provides a more detailed analysis of the problems in chapter 4 of the report. These include:

- inefficiency and cost-ineffectiveness in the provision of services;
- lack of beneficiary accountability, political interference and patronage;
- lack of community participation;
- lack of proper monitoring and evaluation;
- lack of financial sustainability

The chapter concludes with a comment on SAP II, the next phase in the government social

development initiative, and offers some words of caution and advice if the problems of SAP I are to be avoided.

Chapter 5 concludes by outlining a strategy for social sector development that incorporates valuable experience gained from earlier programmes. The Chapter first suggests a strategy for SAP-11 and then an alternate strategy for the wider sphere of the social sectors in general.

Besides, the review contains a number of annexure which can be of tremendous use to those invited in social sector and presents a province-wise profile of selected social indicators.

Sir, Ladies and Gentlemen, the launching of the inaugural Annual Review of Social Development in Pakistan is a proud moment in our history. It represents the bringing together of several years of research. We feel that it has set us a standard which will be difficult to emulate in future years, but we will endeavour. I hope that all of you will find the Review informative and useful. We have tried to meet the needs of a wide spectrum of people ranging from the workers in social sector development to the people who formulate policy. I sincerely hope we have achieved this. Only the future and your response will tell us.

Thank you.

**ADDRESSBY**  
**H.E MARIE-ANDREE BEAUCHEMIN**  
**CANADIAN HIGH COMMISHIONER**

**ADDRESS BY H.E. MARIE-ANDREE BEAUCHEMIN,  
CANADIAN HIGH COMMISSIONER**

Governor Haider, Chairman Qureshi, Dr. Ghaus, ladies and gentlemen,

It is a pleasure to participate at this launching of "Social Policy Development", the inaugural Annual Review produced by the social Policy Development Centre.

It is a pleasure for three reasons: First, because SPDC has produced a landmark report, which offers a new vision for social development in Pakistan. Second, because it clearly demonstrates that SPDC has now established itself as a primary catalyst for social change in Pakistan. And third, because this report is one of the fruits of the very rich development partnership that exists between Canada and Pakistan.

This report is first and foremost a courageous document - a manifesto for social development in Pakistan. Significantly, SPDC has brought down this manifesto just as Pakistan marks its 50th anniversary of independence, which provides opportunity for both reflection and resolve. The report presents a searing indictment of the way in which the social sectors have for half a century been neglected in Pakistan. Few are spared, including, I note, we donors.

But the report also sets out a bold action plan to improve the social indicators quickly and effectively, including thoughtful recommendations on improving the Social Action Programme. The report is at the same time a uniquely credible document. Its often provocative views are supported by the thorough and innovative research which has become SPDC's trademark. Based on this strong empirical foundation, the report should be seen as balanced in its views and constructive in its approach.

The report also presents arguments which are often complex and usually very technical in a way which is appealing - this is not a document which is doomed to gather dust on some academic's shelf. Rather, it can be read and debated by a wide spectrum of experts, activists and ordinary citizens, ranging from senior government officials to grade school teachers. And this is exactly the kind of broadly-based coalition that needs to be mobilized to address the challenges of social development in Pakistan.

I would like to comment on one area in which the report has broken new ground, namely the provinces. SPDC was one of the first organizations in Pakistan to recognize the importance of provincial governments, and to gear much of its work to the provincial levels - in that sense it is certainly quite fitting that this report is being launched in a provincial capital. More substantially, "Social Development in Pakistan" breaks new ground in disaggregating data on a provincial basis, thus illustrating comparative lessons and allowing more strategic and customized interventions. In Canada, we also give due importance to provincial governments, and they have become invaluable "laboratories" to try out and sell new ideas.

Canada's partnership with SPDC began in 1991, when we supported the pioneering work of Dr. Hafiz Pasha and his team in the area of provincial resource mobilization. To institutionalize this work and expand it further SPDC was created in 1995. You should be proud that this is a completely Pakistani institution.

Nonetheless, we also cherish the hope that SPDC has benefitted from Canadian expertise and values. In this connection, I would like to highlight the excellent work done by the Canadian firm, Cowater, as head of consortium which provides advisory services to SPDC. In the partnership between SPDC and Canada, we have learned from each other about building civil society and fostering social development.

SPDC is a crucial but only small part of the dynamics of development cooperation between Canada and Pakistan. Canada has provided development assistance to Pakistan for close to half

a century now and over the years our involvements have changed to reflect Pakistan's evolving needs and capabilities. As a result, we have come to devote less of our aid effort to physical

infrastructure projects, and more to strengthening Pakistan's human resources and institutions. No longer do we see this as primarily a donor: recipient relationship; today, we are seeking a more active, multi-faceted and mature relationship which is sustained by mutual interests.

In the development field, our aim is to facilitate your own efforts to build civil society and improve social conditions, in the process forging enduring linkages between Pakistanis and Canadians. Canada's support for the creation of SPDC fits this new paradigm of Canada-Pakistan development cooperation perfectly - a partnership to build up Pakistan's capacity to help itself.

I am in the twilight of what has been a fascinating and I think, fruitful four years as Canada's High Commissioner in Pakistan. I will leave with many impressions, but the dominant one is of the powerful potential of civil society in Pakistan. In my four years, I have visited community-based projects in well over 100 villages and slums across the breadth of your beautiful country. Just this morning, I visited two schools adopted by Canada in Orangi where, despite grinding poverty, people are finding innovative ways to educate their young. I have come to appreciate the wisdom of what Abdul Sattar Edhi wrote: "the hope for social service delivery lies with the community".

This Report and indeed, the work of SPDC generally, has powerfully defined the challenge in the social sectors. It has also put the onus where it must be, namely the community. There is a Chinese saying, "The longest journey begins with the smallest step". Today, SPDC and all of us have taken a step which is more than small on the very difficult road to social development in Pakistan. While we celebrate that, we must also remember that the journey ahead is long and arduous.

The even greater challenge now will be to determine the best ways in which to tap the inherent strength of your communities. In short, we need to move from advocacy to delivery - and quickly.

Thank you.

**ADDRESS BY  
MR. MOIN QURESHI, CHAIRMAN  
SOCIAL POLICY AND DEVELOPMENT CENTRE**

**ADDRESS BY MR. MOIN QURESHI,  
CHAIRMAN  
SOCIAL POLICY AND DEVELOPMENT CENTRE**

Distinguished Guests, Ladies and Gentlemen, My Friends,

We meet to celebrate an important land mark in the life of the Social Policy and Development Centre. It is truly a great honor and pleasure for me, for my colleagues on the Board of Directors of SPDC, and for the staff to be here for the launch of the first Annual Review of Social Development prepared by the Centre.

It is a matter of great pride that the Social Policy and Development Centre, which was established in 1995 as the brainchild of Dr. Hafiz Pasha, has now progressed to the stage where it can produce an Annual Report of such exemplary quality.

The quality of this Report's analysis and presentation compares with the best reports that I have seen in this field, including those from such prestigious multilateral institutions as the World Bank, or the Regional institutions such as the Asian Development Bank. Clearly, a great deal of credit must go to the staff of the Centre headed by Dr. Aisha Ghaus- Pasha and her associates and, of course, to the inspiring leadership of Dr. Hafiz Pasha.

Finally, it would very remiss of me not to acknowledge with deep appreciation the invaluable contribution of CIDA- both the financial sustenance and the moral and intellectual support that they have funded on a continuing basis. Perhaps it might have been wiser if after having paid these glowing tributes, I had sat down- because the picture that this Report paints of social development in Pakistan is bleak.



The Report states that since Independence, Pakistan's strong economic performance has not been matched by a corresponding rise in the level of its social development. Pakistan's economy is nearly ten times larger than it was at Independence in terms of economic growth but in terms of literacy, life expectancy, infant mortality rates, and other key indicators of social development, we rank very low compared to even some of the poorest countries in the World. The Report goes on to say that a fundamental change is urgently needed in the country's approach to social development. If this doesn't occur, Pakistan can expect to be left far behind its neighbors in the next millennium.

Is this really true? It certainly does not seem very consistent with what we hear frequently these days about the macro-economic situation of Pakistan. We are told that it is improving, that the balance-of-payments is stronger and that foreign exchange reserves are rising; in short, that the economy has turned the corner and rapid development is in prospect. That might well be the case in terms of statistics but I do not see it in the faces and eyes of the people that I meet.

I only see there a sense of growing hopelessness as people struggle with the unbearable burden of their daily lives - trying to meet their basic needs in an environment of growing deprivation. What joy do large foreign exchange reserves bring to a man who cannot buy enough food to satisfy hunger because food prices have risen a great deal faster than his wages? What satisfaction can a lot of new private schools give to parents who cannot enroll their children in them because they cannot afford the fees? And imagine the torment of a family which suddenly loses its only breadwinner due to the lack of timely and accessible medical care and has no social security system to fall back upon. Even for those who are affluent, who can send their children to expensive private schools, and who can have access to the best medical facilities in the land, life today in Pakistan is not secure. Fear stalks the streets of our largest cities. And all who live in them - but especially the rich - are afraid for their lives and their property.

These, my friends, are the early signs of a nation's impoverishment, not of renewed progress. I do not mean to suggest that these are easy problems to solve or that they can be solved overnight.

But our leaders must rise to these challenges or the challenges will overwhelm them.

We have now had two free and fair elections in our country - the one that I conducted in 1993 and the one last year which elected the present Government. There are some who were unhappy with

the results of the 1993 elections and there are others who dislike the results of the 1997 elections. But whether we like the results or not, it is time to face up to the fact that this is how the democratic process works: the people have freely expressed their choice and we must all support the Government as it proceeds to deal with the country's problems.

Of course, the rhetoric, or even the process of democracy, is not sufficient by itself to deal with the country's problems. It does not feed the people, it does not clothe them and it does not provide a roof over their heads. If the Government is to be true to its mandate, it must bend its energies - all of its energies - to improving the human condition throughout the length and breadth of Pakistan.

The challenges facing the Government are greatest in the social sector field. It is admittedly difficult to find the resources for social services when the country is faced with a serious economic crisis, when every department of the Government clamors for funds, and when quick political and economic benefits can be realized from a wide range of more popular programs. In contrast, the pay-back from social sector investment takes a number of years and its benefits - improvements in human skills, longer and more productive lives for the people - cannot readily be perceived.

The 1998 Review of Social Development explains why the growth of Pakistan's economy appears to have lost momentum in the 1990's. Initially, Pakistan directed its investment resources towards the development of an economic infrastructure and achieved relatively high growth. However, this was accompanied by a simultaneous under investment in the social sectors which is now beginning to exert severe limits on the country's growth. These strategic lapses of the past must now be corrected, and the Government must recognize that it is now time to move boldly in the area of social development.

In my view, nothing is more important for nation-building than the development of human resources and nothing achieves it more effectively than education. Pakistan suffers at both ends of the educational spectrum. The neglect of pre-school and primary education has pushed Pakistan close to the bottom of the list of developing countries in terms of literacy levels. And the situation with respect to women - even though it has improved over the last quarter century - is still alarming. The literacy rate for women in Pakistan is barely half of that for men and, the rate for men, at 50 percent, is one of the lowest amongst developing countries.

The situation in higher education is equally depressing and the quality of science and technology training has suffered most. Our universities, for the most part, turn out armies of white-collared workers who add to the pool of the unemployed. By contrast, India has forged ahead with impressive advances both in primary education and in science and technology training, patterned on the best universities of the Western world.

The analysis in the 1988 Review of the health sector shows that major improvements in the quality of health services in Pakistan occurred mainly during the first thirty years, or so, after Independence. Since then, there has been no significant improvement although some efforts by international aid agencies such as UNICEF appear to have resulted in a steady decline in infant mortality rates.

I do not wish to burden you with too many statistics about social conditions and social problems in Pakistan. I can illustrate them most vividly by asking you to think of the condition of our children, particularly those who are born in poverty. Think of a young child who has never known any parents because they died in an epidemic, or in a road accident, or, worse still, because the parents sold their child in order to be able to feed their other children. Think how such children fend for themselves in our society - they beg, or steal, or live for the gratification of their so-called "protectors" who, in turn, exploit them for their own ends. And, mind you, if such a child is lucky-extraordinarily lucky - he or she gets to work twelve hours a day for a mere pittance at some children's factory, weaving carpets, or sewing football covers, or making tennis shoes. Such a child has probably never known the unselfish love of a family or a home, never known what it is to be kind and generous to others, never known the wide and wonderful world that opens to a person's mind with education.

Think, my friends, that there are at least a million such children-possibly many more - in the urban areas of our country. As someone said - a mind is a terrible thing to waste. Let us not allow this young generation of ours to go to waste merely because they are poor.

From time to time, in the onward march of history, there are visionary leaders who can recognize that history has presented them with a unique opportunity to change the fate of their nation. I

sincerely believe that Mian Nawaz Sharif and his Government, with its enormous majority in the Legislature, have been given such an opportunity to rebuild the nation and to impart to it a character and quality that the founder of Pakistan had envisioned. Quaid-e-Azam had envisioned a country that would be based on Islamic principals of social justice, which would help unite the Muslim community and provide for fair and equitable treatment of non-Muslims. His objective was to develop a modern and progressive state that would effectively utilize its full economic resources to better the lives of all of its people.

In my view, the most important task for the present Government, is to unite the country, to bind up the wounds that have been inflicted in the political warfare of the past several years, and, most importantly, to begin to focus on the emerging problems of our society, and of human development. This means turning our attention to such areas as education, health, housing, population planning, water supply and sanitation, as the critical building blocks of the country's future development.

The Government cannot tackle these issues alone. Its role must be to stimulate and support and to provide leadership - to lead by example. As Mr. Abdul Sattar Edhi says in his interview which is published in the 1998 Review, we need to awaken the community. And we need to spread the message far and wide that self-help is the key to our salvation. The welfare revolution must begin at the grass roots and if it is properly organized, it will mobilize the enormous - now dormant-

potential of the poor to become highly productive members of our society.

The 1998 Annual Review sets out a blueprint on how this can be done. First, an unequivocal commitment by our political leaders to social sector development would dramatically alter the environment and accelerate the pace of social development. Second, we must improve the efficiency of social services - especially at the Provincial level and increase accountability. Third, there is an urgent need to create a far more friendly and open environment in which NGOs and Private Sector Organizations are encouraged to play their full part in programs of social uplift.

The Review demonstrates conclusively - through painstaking analysis - that policies of diverting investment from economic to social sectors hold out the promise, over a reasonable length of time, of not only improving the quality of life of our people but also of reinforcing the country's

economic growth.

The Report also sets out the key elements of a future Social Sector Development Policy in Pakistan. It makes the obvious point - though this is not often realized - that the immediate priority of policy makers should be to enhance the quality of services rather than to expand building and staff. It argues for a comprehensive social sector planning framework that recognizes and builds on the synergy between different sectors. It makes a persuasive case for the decentralization of social sector programs, and for a participatory approach that engages the recipients in the design and Grafting of the programs. And, most important of all, it suggests ways in which politicians can have a positive rather than a perverse role in the selection and implementation of specific social programs.

This is, indeed, a Report of outstanding quality, - a rich mine of information which all the major actors in the field of Social Sector Development - the Federal and Provincial Governments, the NGOs, the Private Sector Organizations and the people themselves - can continue to tap for a long time to come. I have absolutely no doubt that if the Government builds on the policies that are set forth in this Report, it will be able within four to five years to witness the emergence of a healthier,

more cohesive and more vibrant .nation. I sincerely believe - as I believe, do most Pakistanis, that this Government will commit itself to this task and that it will be successful.

But the message of this Annual Review is not just for the Government; it is also for you and me. Many people are depressed at the current state of affairs. My message to you is one of hope. I have a profound faith in the future of Pakistan. I see a country that is rich in God's bounty and I see people whose energy and enterprise are waiting to be unleashed.

And yet, some 50 years after Independence, Pakistanis give the appearance of confused people who seem to have most their way. We seem more interested in working against each other rather than with each other. Pakistanis are rugged individuals and somewhat undisciplined. But time and again, when a catastrophe seemed around the corner, the people have risen and have closed ranks in a common cause. That common cause, in my view, as we approach the next century, is human and

societal development.

I am reminded of what Winston Churchill had to say about the United States. He said, "The United States invariably does the right thing after it has exhausted every other alternative". Nevertheless, the way forward is clear. We should begin to think not of what others can do for us but what we can do for ourselves. To paraphrase Mr. Edhi, we must change the culture of dependence to one of self-help and ignite a welfare revolution that is community centered rather than directed from above. If we light this torch, and let the flame burn brightly, I am confident that we shall soon move out of our current valley of darkness into a much brighter future for our country and for our children.

May God be with you,

Khuda Hafiz

Pakistan Zindabad

**ADDRESS BY**  
**H.E Lt Gen. MOIN UDDIN HAIDER (Retd)**  
**GOVERNOR OF SINDH**

**ADDRESS BY H.E. Lt. Gen. MOIN UDDIN HAIDER (Retd),  
GOVERNOR OF SINDH**

Mr. Moeen Qureshi the Chairman, her Excellency Marie Andre Beauchmen, Canadian Higher Commissioner, Dr. Aisha Ghaus-Pasha, distinguished guests ladies and gentlemen,

First of all let me begin with saying that today I see in the audience very high quality people here and you have heard from the rostrum, very learned speakers and I think after what Moeen Qureshi Sahib has already spoken to you, I have nothing more to add but all the same a few words and therefore, I would skip most of the speech. It has a lot about statistics. First of all, I have read through the whole document and it was a very good education for me. Although most of the facts and figure wherever I go I am briefed about and by and large and I am up to date on the facts and figures. But there were many new pointers, there were many new directions and the way the whole thing has been put together, it shows us a line of action. Other than that, they have diagnosed the disease and told what has gone wrong and what we should be doing now. This would certainly help the policy makers.

I often say that if somebody read the constitution of Pakistan and if somebody read legal documents and the rules of business he would say that Pakistan as a country cannot go wrong. There are lots of checks and balances and these are very nicely written documents. Many times, when our planners give budget speeches or say the words of wisdom, you read them in newspapers and are very much inspired and motivated. But the problem comes in the implementation stage. The political commitments, your will to execute something and to move in that direction inspite of all the difficulties can overcome these problems - which are there - the ground realities. Well it is there where we lack.

I think these days we must be reading all the news about the schools in Punjab. They have requested the Army to survey all the schools for them to see whether they exist on ground or not.

People are getting their pay but the staff is not teaching and is nowhere to be seen. Nevertheless, when you see and look back at the fifty years of Pakistan we have made impressive achievement in



many things. If at that time we had two universities, today I think we are getting close to 40 universities. Sindh alone has 14 universities; six in the public sector and 8 in the private sector and these universities in the private sector by and large are performing well. If you see the number of schools, the number of colleges, in terms of number of their enrollment we have come a long way. But of course the population increase has been equally fast and at some point of time we gave up this family planning programme and the population grew and ousted all our development. So in the same way if I ask you the number of airports, number of roads, in terms of kilometers I think it is very impressive. But as Mr. Moeen Qureshi said that the quality of people on the ground has not changed much and even if it has changed, when we start comparing ourselves no more with the West but within the region, we do not feel too proud about it. If Pakistan is the second last, last one being Nepal, I do not know when they are going to overtake us or us going to overtake others. This shows the pathetic state of education. The point I am coming to is, the question of implementation. The political will and commitment are required to do these things. I am quite sure, this document with all its facts and figures and research, will point out toward the policy makers, the implementators, the educationists, who are going to implement this programme and will prove to be a very useful document.

You know and I know that we are cutting down for examples, on our seats for medical doctors. The documents may say that for so many hundreds of people we have fewer doctors, but we cutting down seats though we have the capacity. I went to the Civil Hospital to inaugurate the children's ward and the figures the doctors gave me were that there were 1675 beds in Civil Hospital in Karachi and they were 1600 doctors posted in the Civil Hospital. I think nowhere in the world you have this ratio of one doctor to one bed. But it is here. I go to many schools and I find them over staffed. There are three Sindhi teachers there but a few students to learn and there may be many teachers in other disciplines but there are schools devoid of teachers whatsoever. So it is also a question of distribution. No body wants to go to rural areas. And if you ask a doctor where did you get your degree of medicine, he would say from Chandka or he would say from Jamshooro and when I ask him where is your home district he would say Sanghroo, Mirpur Khas. And when I ask him that why don't you go back to your Goth and serve those peoples - your brothers and relatives, he would say that there are no medicines and people would involve us in medical cases. He is not brave enough to go there, sort out things and improve things, He finds an easy way to come to a city and settle here. So such are the problems and when we are actually going through these reports

many of these things with ground realities have to be grasped.

There is no doubt that investment in human resource is never wasted many times and in many refined works that have been produced you find that with this x number of inputs what is going to be the output. I think there a very nice relationship that has been established but of course, it cannot be worked out like the feasibility report of the industry or a bank or can tell what is the money requirement for giving clean water supply, giving education and improving health facilities. Its effect is seen all over and after quite sometime. But the relationship of course has been established and everybody has now come to believe especially those people who are implementing such programmes and seeing the examples of other countries that unless you have achieved a literacy rate of 70 percent of universal education throughout the country, you cannot afford to really thrust forward with all speed in industry, agriculture and elsewhere. So in all the success stories of Asian Tigers, if you see, this was one of the basic pre-requisites and of course if you don't have a healthy nation, if you cannot give clean water and people all over are falling sick, we are wasting long hours - weeks and days of our work hours. Obviously, it is understood that we will lack behind. But my impression as I keep traveling and keep reading many people, is that people have become aware of the problem. Now people think that education is their right. When you go to the interior Sindh it is very encouraging to see girls coming out and their parents willingly wanting to send girls for education. This was not so many years back. We saw that there is willingness on the part of the people who want to be educated and there is willingness on the part of the government. Under pressure and because of their manifestos and I think many of them genuinely, have understood that without improvement in the social domain, there can be no progress. So there seems to be more genuine feelings and more seriousness in this regard.

So these two factors put together and these reports to guide us and many donor agencies to help us as Moeen Qureshi Sahib has pointed out, the future seems bright. The Social Action Programme I, I think is giving way to Social Action Programme II and I hope where we have faulted our policy makers will make a note of it, see where we went wrong, analyse the situation and I think with better management, with more commitment and dedication and mobilisation of community, we must understand that the burden of education cannot only be undertaken by government or by any SAP Programme. If we think it is good for us we have to find the resources and this is not difficult. Sometimes the money is there but the management is not there, the commitment is not there. So I

cannot understand why in a community or a Goth, where there is a retired Headmaster or there is a notable whom people would like to listen to, why he cannot be involved in overseeing that particular school and see that the teachers do come up for teaching. Why can't he see the students also appear, what is being taught there is correct and is according to the needs of the future?

So I have seen many programmes, by several NGOs in this field that are very encouraging and are mobilising the community towards this respect. They are wanting the parents to take interest in these things. They say your job is not finished by sending your child to the school - you have to follow. So I see due recognition by parents and parent-teacher associations being strengthened and at many places, I see responsible community workers being involved. So these steps, mobilisation and the excellent job by some NGOs, I think, will improve things.

One thing that I fear is not possible is on page 49 which Mr. Moeen Qureshi has already clarified is that the quality of higher education also is not very good. Our degrees do not have the prestige and the respect they ought to have. But I thought the study said that we are investing more in higher education at the cost of universal primary education, page 49-a box. So I beg to differ with that. I think only the primary education or the middle level education will not see Pakistan through and will not meet the needs of this country. And as we have realised that there is a lot of potential and there are brains as far as the people are concerned. Every morning hundreds and thousands of people get out of their homes not with idea of committing a dacoity or snatching a car but they

get in the morning to earn an honest living for their wife and children. They want to work. They want to sweat. We sometimes cannot provide them the ideal circumstances but those people are willing to work honestly. As far as our brains are concerned, I think it has been amply highlighted. Individually, everywhere we have proved our metal. But it is the question of having a universal education and developing the whole nation, together moving in one direction. So I feel that our investment in higher education must continue and we must try to have excellence. We must have few institutes of excellence where our people after universal education, which is very essential, should develop their brains and expertise provides intellectual guidance to this nation. Of course it is very desirable that our universities come up to a certain standard. But if not, we must have few - I think we have. Tomorrow I know press would say that each and every university should be very good. But if we have limited resources, then you have to have your priorities. You have to have

correct direction. And I think in this regard, in the private sector some very fine universities are coming up which sometimes are not affordable. But there are many people who can pay and I am very happy with the approach of SPDC in this regard and personally I very strongly believe that if we have the capacity to pay for education, for health we must make the people pay. Because any thing free is not taken seriously. If you give a very fine book but if it is all free I will not put it on very a high list of reading. But if I have to pay some hundred rupees for it, I will read it very quickly. This is what is natural. So I feel investment in higher education is essential.

May I congratulate you, Dr. Aisha Ghaus and your team led by Mr. Moeen Qureshi for compiling a very useful document for all the general readers, the users, the implementors and the policy makers. I hope we can make use of it and move forward in the correct direction.

Ladies and Gentlemen, Thank you very much.

# PROGRAMME

**SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT IN  
PAKISTAN ANNUAL REVIEW,1998**

*27th April, 1998*

**PROGRAMME**

- ✍ Tilawat with Translation
  
- ✍ Welcome Address by Dr. Aisha Ghaus-Pasha  
Acting Managing Director, SPDC
  
- ✍ Address by H.E. Marie - Andree Beauchemin,  
Canadian High Commissioner
  
- ✍ Speech by Mr. Moeen Qureshi,  
Chairman, SPDC
  
- ✍ Address by H.E. Lt. Gen. Moin Uddin Haider (Retd.),  
Governor of Sindh
  
- ✍ Vote of Thanks by Zafar H. Ismail,  
Company Secretary
  
- ✍ Reception

**LIST OF  
PARTICIPANTS**

## **LIST OF PARTICIPANTS**

### **SPDC STEERING COMMITTEE AND CONSULTANTS**

Ms. Kathleen M. Humpage	Cowater International Cor. Inc, Canada
Mr. Christopher Liebich	Canadian High Commission Islamabad
Mr, S. Zafar Hassan Mahmood	National Tariff Commission Islamabad
Mr. Micheal McGar ry	Cowater International Inc. Islamabad
Dr. Mutawakkil Kazi	Planning and Development Division Islamabad
Mr. Shahid Kardar	Systems (Pvt) Ltd., Lahore
Ms. Shaheen Atique-ur-Rehman	BUNYAD/BLCC, Lahore
Mr. Taj Muhammad Faiz	Area Development Programme, Quetta, Balochistan
Mr. A, Wajid Rana	Expaco, Clifton, Karachi
Mr. Javaid Hasan	Cowater, Peshawar
Mr. WasifA. Rizvi	Karachi
Dr. Jim Friedman	University of Western Ontario Canada

### **CONSULATE/EMBASSY**

Dr. David Merry	British High Commission, Karachi
Mr. Byram Avari	Hon.. Consul General of Canada Karachi
Mr. M, Rehman Qureshi	Indonesian Consulate, Karachi



## **DONORS (LOCAL OFFICE)**

H.E. Marie-Andree Beauchemin	High Commissioner of Canada Islamabad
Mr. Tariq Qureshi	Programme Support Unit, Islamabad
Ms. Shehia Rashiuddin	United Nations Children's Fund, Karachi
Ms. Zeba Bokhari	United Nations Children's Fund, Karachi
Dr. Asad Ali Abro	World Health Organization (WHO), Islamabad
Dr. Asif Mirza	World Health Organization (WHO), Islamabad
Ms. Perveen Makda	USIS, Karachi
Dr. Patrici L. Sharpe	USIS, Karachi
Mr. Javed Sadiq	USIS, Karachi
Mr. John Wall	The World Bank, Islamabad

## **INSTITUTES AND ORGANIZATIONS [PAKISTAN]**

Dr. Abdul Hakim	National Institute of Population Studies (NIPS) Islamabad.
Mr. MehbubAhmed	National Institute of Population Studies (NIPS) Islamabad.
Dr. Aliya H. Khan	Quaid-e-Azam University, Islamabad
Ms. Zubaida Jalal	District Turbat, Makran, Balochistan
Dr. Mehtab S. Karim	The Aga Khan University, Stadium Road, Karachi
Dr. RahatAlam	Usman Institution of Technology, Karachi
Ms. A. R.Chaudhri	University of Punjab, Lahore
Dr. Salman Shah	Lahore Institute of Finance and Management, Lahore
Mr. Abbad Hussain	State Bank of Pakistan Library, Karachi

Ms. Amtul Wadood	Applied Economics Research Centre, Karachi
Ms. Samina Khalil	Applied Economics Research Centre, Karachi
Mr. Ashraf Wasti	Applied Economics Research Centre, Karachi
Mr. Sohail Javed	Applied Economics Research Centre, Karachi
Ms. Shahnaz Rashid	Applied Economics Research Centre, Karachi
Mr. Sikandar Nadeem	Applied Economics Research Centre, Karachi
Mr. S.M. Jameel	Applied Economics Research Centre, Karachi

### **GOVERNMENT OF PAKISTAN**

Dr. Pervez Tahir	Planning and Development Division, Islamabad
Mr. M. H. Kizillbash	Planning Commission, Islamabad
Mr. Talib Hussain Talib	Planning and Development Division, Islamabad
Dr. Aslam Khan	Planning and Development Division, Islamabad
Dr. Ashfaq Hasan Khan	Ministry of Finance, Islamabad
Mr. Iqbal Panwar	University Grants Commission, Karachi
Mr. Kamal Hyat	Planning and Development Division, Islamabad
Mr. Ashfaque Memon	Census Commissioner of Punjab, Lahore

### **GOVERNMENT OF SINDH**

General Moinuddin Haider (Retd.)	Governor Sindh, Karachi
Mr. Saiek Nazir Ahmed &	Additional Chief Secretary
Ms. Ghazala Qazi	(Dev) P&D Karachi
Mr. Muhammad Ali Khaskheli	Provincial SAP Coordinator, Karachi
Mr. Iqbal Ahmed Solangi	Director General E & T, Karachi

Mr. Yahya Waliullah	Sindh Bureau of Statistics, Karachi
Mr. Siarajul Haque Kazi	D.G. Sindh Regional Plan Organization, Karachi
Mr. Jamal Amir	Sindh Katchi Abadis Authority, Karachi
Brdg. MansoorAhmad	M.D. Karachi Water and Sewerage Board, Karachi
Ms. Bella Jamil	Sindh Education Foundation, Karachi
Mr, Abbasi [Nominee of Mr. M.Tahir Soomro]	Secretary Transport, Karachi
Mr. Ali Ahmed	Sindh Bureau of Statistics, Karachi
Mr. Abdullah Soomro	Sindh Bureau of Statistics, Karachi
Mrs. Najmul Hassan	Sindh Bureau of Statistics, Karachi
Syed Faisal Saud	Secretary Housings Town Planning, Karachi
Dr. Salman Memon	Director Coordinator National Drainage Program
Mr. Asad	Deputy Commissioner

#### **GOVT OF PUNJAB**

Mr. Naguibullah Malik	Member (SAP), Lahore
Mr. Saqib Aleem	Provincial SAP Coordinator, Lahore
Mr. Syed Tanveer Abbas Jaffri	Secretary Population Welfare, Lahore

#### **GOVT OF NWFP**

Sayed Khan Orakzai [Nominee of Mr. Muhammad Fareed Khan]	Secretary LGRDD, Peshawar
---	---------------------------

#### **GOVT OF BALOCHISTAN**

Mr. Ata Muhammad Jafar	Secretary Finance, Quetta
Mr. Mohammad Yahya	Deputy Accountant General, Quetta

## NGOs

Mr. Rashid Bajwa	GM National Rural Support Programme Islamabad
Mr. Bernard Woods	Cowater, Islamabad
Mr. All Akbar [Nominee of Dr. Suleiman Sheikh]	Executive Director SPO, Islamabad
Mr. Joe Bogler	Aga Khan Foundation, Islamabad
Dr. Kaiser Bengali	SDPI, Islamabad
Dr. KaramatAli	PILER, Karachi
Dr. Asad Sayeed	PILER, Karachi
Qadeer Baig	NGORC, Karachi
Ms. Azra Babar	Banh Beli, Karachi
Zulqarnain All Shah	Institute of Development Studies and Practice Karachi
Ms. Durdana Soomro	Institute of Development Studies and Practice Karachi
Chief Co-ordinator	Community Development Network Forum Larkana
Mr. Magbool Mashori	Community Development Network Forum Larkana
Ms. AnarMamdani [Nominee of Mr. Asif Merchant]	CEO Aga Khan Housing Board of Pakistan Karachi
Begum Daulat Hidayatullah	President, All Pakistan Women's Association Karachi South Asia Partnership
Mr. Irfan Mufti [Nominee of Mr. Muhammad Tesheen]	South Asia Partnership (SAP-PK), Lahore
Ms. Stella Jafry	IUCN, Karachi
Ms. NargisAlvi	IUCN, Karachi
Mr. Syed Asif	Division Management Consultant

## **OTHERS**

Dr. Syed Nawab Haider Naqvi	Islamabad
Dr. Ehsan Rashid	Karachi
Dr. Ashfaq Kadri	Karachi
Mr. Fakhruddin	Department of Economics, University of Karachi
Ms. SanaGhayas	Karachi
Mr. S. S, Jafary	Karachi
Dr. Arshad Zaman	Arshad Zaman Associate (Pvt) Ltd . Karachi
Mr. Aftab Ahmed Khan	Sindh Club, Karachi
Ms. Ayesha Mahmood	National Bank of Pakistan, Karachi
Ms. ShahnazWazirAli	Karachi
Prof. Sajjad Haider	Lahore
Ms. Amina Azfar	Karachi
Bilal Qureshi	Karachi
Anwar Shafi	Karachi

## **MEDIA**

Mr, AzharAbbas	Business Update Karachi
Mr. BabarAyyaz	Business Update Karachi
Mr. Ghayyur-ul-Islam	Daily Dawn Karachi
Mr. M. B.Naqvi	Daily Dawn Karachi
Mr. Shahzad Amjad	The News, Karachi
Mr. Mohsin Jaffery	The News, Karachi
Mr. Wamiq Zuberi	Daily Business Recorder, Karachi

Mr. Ghazi Salahuddin	Daily Jang Karachi
Ms. IsmatSabir	Daily Jang Karachi
Mr, Akram Khan	Daily Jang Karachi
Mr, WaqarAnjum Rao	Independent Communication Network, Karachi
Ms. Fizza Shakeel	Independent Communication Network, Karachi
Mr. Javed Faruqi	Country Manager, Ltd. Karachi

### **REUTERS**

Mr. Owais Tauheed	Bureau Chief, AFP Karachi
Mr, Mannan	Creative Unit Karachi
Ms. Ameena Saiyed	Oxford University Press Pakistan, Karachi
Mr. Qutubuddin	Member, CPNE, Karachi
Mr, Farhan Bokhari	Financial Times, Rawalpindi
Ms. Shezana Ikram	Tha Daily Dawn, Karachi
Mr. Asad Javed Rizvi	Financial Post, Karachi
Mr. M. A. Zuberi	Editor, The Business Recorder, Karachi
Mr. Syed Jawaid Iqbal	Editor, South Asia Magazine, Karachi
Mr. Sabehuddin Ghaus	The Dawn, Karachi
Mr, Riazuddin	Editor, Millat, Karachi
Professor Hassan	Investment & Marketing, Karachi
Mrs. Ateeq Hassan	Investment & Marketing, Karachi
Mr, Rafi Nasser	Associated Press of Pakistan, Karachi

### **BANKS / CORPORATE / BUSINESS**

Mr. NisarMemon	IBM World Trade Corporation, Karachi
----------------	--------------------------------------

Mr. K. Y. Mirza	The Chief Executive, Abbott Laboratories, Karachi
Mr. Muhammad Mian Soomro	National Bank of Pakistan, Karachi
Mr. Arif Habib	President, Stock Exchange, Karachi
Mr. Yaseen Hakhani	Stock Exchange, Karachi
Mr. Nadir Morshid	Taurus Securities, Karachi
Aseem Khan	Sales Manager, Hamdard Press Pvt. Limited, Karachi.
Mr. Shahzad Najmi	Comprehensive Book Services, Karachi
Mr. Mohammad Nasim, FCA	A.F. Ferguson & Co. Karachi
Col, Muhammad Faizuddin	Greenwich Institute, Karachi
Mr. Salman Ahmed	Engineering Systems (Pvt.) Ltd. Karachi
Ms. Fatima Namazi	C/o Nasira School, Karachi
Mr. Mohammad Muneem	Information Deptt c/o Press Service

#### **MEDIA COVERAGE**

Mr. Abdul Hasnat	The Daily Dawn, Karachi
Ms. Reema Abbasi	The News, Karachi
Mr. Rameez Ahmed	The News, Karachi
Mr. Ejaz Hashmi	The News, Karachi
Mr. Zubair Ahmed	The Daily Business Recorder, Karachi
Mr. Anwar Rajani	The Daily Business Recorder, Karachi
Mr. Iqbal Mirza	The Daily Business Recorder, Karachi
Mr. Zahid Hussain	Daily Jang Karachi

Mr. Sajjad Khan                      Daily Jang, Karachi

Mr. Saeed Azhar                      Bureau Chief, PPI

**REUTERS Ltd**

Mr. Shiekh Saleem                      Financial Post, Karachi

Mr. Jalal Qureshi                      Financial Post, Karachi

Mr. Mujahid Barelvi                      The Frontier Post

Mr. M. Waseem                      Pakistan Television, Karachi